



# Human Trafficking Courses in Undergraduate Criminology and Criminal Justice Curricula in the USA

Tatyana Zhilina<sup>1</sup>

University of West Georgia, Carrollton, USA

## Abstract

*The crime of human trafficking has received increased international attention as a social problem and area of scholarly study over the past decade. This study seeks to explore the extent to which human trafficking is a subject of study in current undergraduate criminal justice and criminology curricula in the United States. Examined were web-based documents for 100 criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in colleges and universities throughout the country. The programs were sampled from the U.S. News and World Report 2011 list of “Best Colleges.” The investigation revealed only eight courses from seven programs that covered human trafficking issues. Suggestions for developing and adding courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice curricula are made, as well as suggestions for future research.*

Keywords: Human Trafficking, Criminology, Criminal Justice, Under Graduate.

## Introduction

The crime of human trafficking has received increased international attention over the past decade. Human trafficking is now developing into a subject of widespread interest to governments, nongovernmental actors, and scholars. In recent years, numerous anti-trafficking statutes have been passed or amended, anti-trafficking agencies and organizations have proliferated, and an impressive amount of research on human trafficking and contemporary slavery has been conducted by scholars from a diverse range of disciplines (Gozdziak & Bump, 2008; U.S. Department of State, 2010).

Human trafficking is a “contemporary manifestation of slavery” that affects millions of men, women, and children in every country and nation (U.S. Congress, 2000). Trafficking for sex and labor occurs both within and between countries (Aronowitz, 2009). People from vulnerable populations are trafficked into labor or sexual exploitation for little or no pay. The duties of modern slaves vary: exotic dancing, pornography, hotel work, restaurant labor, construction, factory labor, housekeeping, childcare, landscaping, gardening, trinket selling, street begging, and criminal activities such as prostitution, selling and/or transporting drugs, pick pocketing, and moving arms or stolen vehicles (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009; Aronowitz, 2009). Some live in private residences where they

<sup>1</sup> Part-Time Instructor, Departments of Criminology and Sociology, University of West Georgia, Carrollton, GA, USA 30118. E-mail: tzhilina@gmail.com

must work long hours as housekeepers, maids, and nannies, while others work in sweatshops, factories, hotels, nail salons, restaurants, agricultural fields or in the sex industry. While victims' experiences vary according to gender and situational variables, sexual abuse is more commonly experienced by persons trafficked into sexual exploitation. Women and girls (and sometimes men and boys) trafficked into forced labor can be sexually assaulted as well (Logan et al., 2009).

Aside from being a crime, human trafficking entails grave violations of human rights. Undoubtedly, the issue of human trafficking is perceived as a multi-dimensional threat by many governments and non-governmental organizations. The U. S. Department of State (2008) elaborates on the impact of human trafficking:

It deprives people of their human rights and freedoms, it increases global health risks, and it fuels the growth of organized crime. Human trafficking has a devastating impact on individual victims, who often suffer physical and emotional abuse, rape, threats against self and family, and even death. But the impact of human trafficking goes beyond individual victims; it undermines the health, safety, and security of all nations it touches.

To address the issue of human trafficking, the United States Government advocates a three-prong approach consisting of prevention, protection, and prosecution (U.S. Department of State, 2010). Thus, the U. S. criminal justice system plays an important role in addressing human trafficking because effective prosecution and criminal sanctions are in its realm. Thirty eight human trafficking task forces funded by the U.S. Department of Justice have been established to provide case coordination and law enforcement training (U.S. Department of State, 2010).

These developments in the anti-trafficking movement are part of a changing world to which education must adapt. Human trafficking courses are offered in a variety of programs such as social work and interdisciplinary social studies. The focus of the current study is on crime studies programs. Human trafficking requires attention from criminology and criminal justice education as these disciplines are thought to heavily influence the criminal justice system and perceptions of crime. Attention to human trafficking given by college-level crime studies programs would provide knowledge that enables individuals to critically examine the issue and seek ways to effectively address the crime, and add a global character to victimological studies. Within this context, the current study seeks to explore the extent to which human trafficking is a subject of study in current criminal justice and criminology curricula in the United States and is followed by a discussion of implications for undergraduate education.

## **Literature Review**

### ***Human Trafficking Legislation and Definitions***

On November 15, 2000, the United Nations General Assembly passed Resolution 55/25 adopting the Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. A supplement to the Convention, the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, also referred to as the Palermo Protocol, defines human trafficking as:

recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of

deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (UNODC, 2000, Article 3(a)).

As of December 2010, the Palermo Protocol has been ratified by 142 countries, including the U.S. (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2010). The Protocol now serves as a paradigm for national legislations regarding human trafficking. The Protocol seeks to “prevent and combat trafficking in persons, paying particular attention to women and children”, “protect and assist victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights”, and “promote cooperation among State Parties in order to meet those objectives” (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime [UNODC], 2000, Article 2). Thus, the Protocol is designed to eliminate human trafficking through creating preventive measures and cooperation among state parties.

The Palermo Protocol criminalizes trafficking in persons and encourages state parties to follow suit. Article 5 requires state parties to “adopt such legislative and other measures as may be necessary to establish as criminal offences” trafficking in persons, “when committed intentionally.” It criminalizes the following activities: attempted trafficking, participation as an accomplice, and “organizing or directing other persons to commit” trafficking (UNODC, 2000, Article 5). Further, the Protocol encourages the cooperation of “law enforcement, immigration or other relevant authorities” to successfully detect traffickers and their victims crossing an international border. Authorities should determine the means and methods of trafficking such as “types of travel documents,” and “recruitment and transportation of victims, routes and links between and among individuals and groups engaged in such trafficking, and possible measures for detecting them” (UNODC, 2000, Article 10). States are further obligated to “provide or strengthen training” to prevent trafficking by effectively identifying potential victims and the methods of traffickers. The Protocol recognizes that such training should “take into account the need to consider human rights and gender-sensitive issues” (UNODC, 2000, Article 10).

As for federal legislation in the United States, the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) was proposed in 2000 as part (Division A) of a larger bill entitled the "Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000." The bill was enacted on October 28, 2000 (U.S. Congress, 2000). To date, the TVPA is the main piece of anti-trafficking legislation in the U.S. Reauthorized in 2003, 2005, and 2008, it has grown in its capacity to provide support to victims of trafficking and for criminal prosecution of traffickers (Chacon, 2010). The TVPA anti-trafficking approach is: “to ensure just and effective punishment of traffickers, and to protect their victims” (U.S. Congress, 2000, Sec. 102(a)). The legislation defines human trafficking as:

A) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or (B) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (U.S. Congress, 2000, sec. 103(8)).

## Scope and Magnitude of the Problem

Victims of human trafficking are difficult to identify because of the clandestine nature of the crime. The actual number of victims involved in sexual exploitation and forced labor remains unknown and likely underestimated, while estimates on the scope of human trafficking differ considerably. Bales (2007) argues that there are approximately 27 million men, women, and children in forced labor and/or sexual servitude at any given time. According to the International Labor Organization (2008), there are 12.3 million people in forced labor and prostitution around the world, and 2.4 million of them were trafficked. Further, the ILO's figures are broken down into different types of human trafficking: "32% of all victims were trafficked into labour exploitation, while 43% were trafficked for sexual exploitation and 25% for a mixture of both" (International Labor Organization, 2008, p. 3). The U.S. Department of State has been providing different estimates over the past decade. The 2003 Trafficking in Persons Report indicated that approximately 800,000 to 900,000 persons are trafficked across national borders each year. This figure does not include victims trafficked within their own countries (U.S. Department of State, 2003). In 2006, the estimated number of persons trafficked across national borders was between 600,000 and 800,000 people (U.S. Department of State, 2006). The most recent Trafficking in Persons Report (U.S. Department of State, 2010) referred to the International Labor Organization's figure of 12.3 million. The Report explicitly states that every country is likely to be affected by human trafficking to some extent (U.S. Department of State, 2008).

Human trafficking is a lucrative crime as it generates about \$32 billion in profits annually (Bales, 2007). The trade in humans adopted a business model approach. Transnational organized crime networks act as business enterprises: their primary goal is the acquisition of profit (Picarelli, 2009). Previously, human trafficking was cited as the third largest criminal industry after the trade in drugs and arms (U.S. Department of State, 2004). It is believed to have recently surpassed trafficking in arms and now is referred to as the second largest criminal industry in the world after drug trafficking (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2010).

Human trafficking has become one of the most serious global social problems. Traffickers deprive their victims of the most basic entitlements and human rights. They take away trafficked people's freedom and ability to make life choices, and, oftentimes, deprive them of basic living needs such as food, safety, and access to healthcare (Logan et al., 2009). Trafficking often results in deadly diseases, mutilations and murder of the trafficked persons (U.S. Congress, 2000). The crime affects the international community as it "involves violations of other laws, including labor and immigration codes and laws against kidnapping, slavery, false imprisonment, assault, battery, pandering, fraud, and extortion" (U.S. Congress, 2000, Sec. 102b (10)). Thus, human trafficking is considered to entail "grave violations of human rights and is a matter of pressing international concern" (U.S. Congress, 2000, Sec. 102b (23)).

## Trafficking Methods

Poverty remains the "single most important factor" that makes persons susceptible to human trafficking (Logan et al., 2009, p. 10). Shirk and Webber (2009) note that traffickers often target people who are desperately searching for ways to find employment and better their lives. Poverty and inequality are considered to be the main driving forces of human trafficking. Once trafficked, victims are controlled and manipulated through a

variety of physical and psychological means. Traffickers maintain control through: taking away victims' travel and identity documents; threatening them with local law enforcement; threatened or actual sexual abuse and physical violence; isolation; disorientation; and debt bondage (Bales & Lize, 2005).

Tiefenbrun (2002) describes a typical sex trafficking scheme, stating that millions of women forced into prostitution could tell the same story. In this trafficking scheme, the criminals are divided into "agents" and "traffickers." The main goal of an agent is to spark a victim's interest with promises of a good job, financial stability, and better life. After gaining the victim's trust, the agent hands the victim over to the trafficker. The trafficker is usually responsible for providing the means to relocate the victim (visas, passport, and transportation). Soon enough, the victim finds herself in debt, without documents, and forced into prostitution in a foreign land. Her escape becomes even less likely when corrupted police aid traffickers (Tiefenbrun, 2002). A similar model is used for labor trafficking. Traffickers often recruit in victims' hometowns by promising jobs. Thus people believe that they are accepting legitimate jobs such as waitressing, landscaping, or domestic work but in reality end up being enslaved (Logan et al., 2009).

Children are targeted by human traffickers because of their "powerlessness, innocence, and inability to protect themselves" (Aronowitz, 2009, p. 37). Homeless children are considered to be particularly vulnerable (Logan et al., 2009). Youth living on the streets encounter poverty, violence, and crime on a daily basis. Engaging in sexual activities in exchange for food or shelter is a common practice for boys as well as girls (Aronowitz, 2009). Children who live in families can be trafficked into labor or sexual exploitation as well. Usually, these children experience emotional, physical and/or sexual abuse, witness substance abuse at home and/or come from impoverished families (Aronowitz, 2009; Logan et al., 2009). In some cases, children are sold into slavery by their parents, relatives, or other caregivers because of the family's desperate economic conditions. Sometimes, parents, deceived by traffickers, believe that their children will receive an education and/or job training and will have a better life than at home (Logan et al., 2009). In the United States, runaway and at risk youth are considered to be an easy target for pimps. Often, pimps befriend such girls by pretending to be their boyfriends and later force them into prostitution (U. S. Department of State, 2010).

The TVPA links human trafficking to the activities of international crime organizations:

Trafficking in persons is increasingly perpetrated by organized, sophisticated criminal enterprises. Such trafficking is the fastest growing source of profits for organized criminal enterprises worldwide. Profits from the trafficking industry contribute to the expansion of organized crime in the United States and worldwide (U.S. Congress, 2000, sec. 102b (8)).

Human trafficking rings may be composed of only one or two associates or traffickers could establish extensive networks with highly organized structures and many partners (Zhang, 2007). Also, traffickers can use human smuggling operations to obtain new victims. Human smuggling is different from human trafficking smuggling involves a willing migrant who is trying to enter a country with the help of smugglers. Mass media, the general public, and law enforcement sometimes conflate these terms (Zhang, 2007). Logan et al. (2009, p. 5) explain the nature of such an operation: "usually, with human smuggling, the relationship between the transporter and the smuggled individual ends

once the target destination is reached.” Victims may be trafficked under the guise of smuggling services offered to them. Many undocumented immigrants have to rely on smugglers, “who are uniquely positioned to engage in both labor and sexual exploitation” (Shirk & Webber, 2004, p. 2). Therefore, human smuggling may escalate to human trafficking.

### ***Law Enforcement Response***

Human trafficking crimes often go undetected by law enforcement. Instead of identified as victims of trafficking, many are seen as prostitutes, undocumented immigrants, or simply as “criminals” (Bernat & Zhilina, 2010). Law enforcement agencies play a critical role, however, as police officers often come into contact with traffickers and their victims. However, they tend to lack the training needed to effectively identify a case as one of human trafficking. Local law enforcement officers often fail to identify cases although they are more likely to encounter human trafficking than federal officers (Farrell, 2009). In a national random sample of approximately 3,000 municipal, county and state law enforcement agencies in the United States, Farrell, McDevitt, and Fahy (2008) found that law enforcement officials differ in their perceptions of human trafficking. Local law enforcement officials tended to believe that human trafficking is rare or non-existent in their communities while agencies serving larger jurisdictions tended to view it as a pervasive problem. Further, only 18 percent reported conducting any type of training in human trafficking recognition and response (Farrell, McDevitt, & Fahy, 2008).

As a result of the lack of detection, victims do not receive needed assistance and remain in their situations, and traffickers go unpunished and continue to engage in their criminal activities. Providing training to law enforcement agencies is among the recommendations given by the U.S. Attorney General’s annual report: “Evaluate law enforcement training programs and consider existing feedback in revising law enforcement training curriculum” (U.S. Attorney General, 2010, p. 15). Human trafficking cases are more likely to be successfully investigated by specifically trained law enforcement agents with experience in human trafficking cases. Bales & Lize (2007, p. 26) state: “such investigators show more sensitivity to the needs of the victims, know how best to handle them, and are aware of superior sources of information to corroborate evidence.” Similarly, Kumar Kibble, Deputy Director of the Office Investigations at Immigration and Customs Enforcement, stated the importance of requiring law enforcement agencies to be victim-oriented: “we in law enforcement have a responsibility to treat victims fairly, with compassion, and with attention to their needs” (Department of Homeland Security, 2007, p. 5).

### ***Educational Response***

The criminal justice system is in a position to effectively respond to human trafficking but lacks needed resources, personnel, and training. Since many criminal justice professionals pursue bachelor’s degrees, college studies provide an opportunity to begin acquiring knowledge about human trafficking. Although other disciplines such as sociology, political science, and social work might offer courses dedicated to human trafficking, it is reasonable to believe that the crime of human trafficking should receive attention by criminal justice and criminology since these disciplines study crime and control, including contemporary issues. Criminology and criminal justice programs are in a good position to lay the necessary groundwork in educating their students about human trafficking and its complexities. Should these students pursue criminal justice or related

careers, they would be prepared to address human trafficking and, eventually, influence their agencies' response to the crime.

Natarajan (2002) describes the need for providing students with knowledge about international crimes and criminal justice systems by developing and implementing "curriculum that would help produce the large numbers of sophisticated investigators who will be needed to deal with international and transnational crimes and criminal organizations" (p. 480). Such curricula then would cover a wide range of topics including "enslavement, <...> sexual slavery, enforced prostitution, forced pregnancy," and "trafficking in humans" among others. Natarajan, (2002) presented the International Criminal Justice Major at John Jay College of Criminal Justice as a model to assist others interested in developing ICJ programs.

Turner, Giacomassi, and Vandiver (2006) discuss the importance of covering historical slavery and slave patrols in the United States in introductory criminal justice textbooks. According to the authors, "the slave patrol should be considered a forerunner of modern American law enforcement" and, thus, should be included in the introductory criminal justice text books (Turner et al., 2006, p. 186). In doing this, it would be beneficial for textbooks to include the historical roots of modern day slavery, a type of human trafficking.

Academicians and practitioners alike have published several works on human trafficking issues (see for example Aronowitz, 2009; Bales, 2007; Bales & Lize, 2005; Barone, 2003; Bernat & Zhilina, 2010; Farrell et al., 2008; Farrell, 2009; Logan et al., 2009; Picarelli, 2009; Shirk & Webber, 2004; Tiefenbrun, 2002; Weitzer, 2007; Zhang, 2007). In short, there is a diverse interdisciplinary field of scholarship on contemporary slavery and human trafficking that produces an ample amount of information from which to draw for course material, or even guidance on how to approach teaching human trafficking courses (Dragiewicz, 2008). Within this context, the current study explores whether human trafficking is specifically reflected in current criminal justice and criminology curricula.

## **Method**

This study explores the presence of courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in colleges and universities in the United States. As stated earlier, criminology and criminal justice were chosen because it seems logical that human trafficking, a crime that requires criminal justice intervention, would be considered a crime studies topic. The programs were explored with the purpose of discovering if current educational curricula sufficiently cover the issue of human trafficking, and how discourses about human trafficking are framed within these curricula. The study attempts to gauge the extent to which criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in the U.S. 1) offer courses dedicated to human trafficking as a part of their educational curriculum 2) require students to take courses on human trafficking and 3) include information about human trafficking as a part of other related courses such as those on organized crime, victimology, juvenile delinquency, and/or domestic violence. Also, human trafficking courses were evaluated in terms of their potential effectiveness teaching the basics of the crime and increasing students' awareness of the issue.

### *Sample of Programs*

To carry out this investigation, the top colleges and universities *with* criminal justice and criminology undergraduate programs in the United States were targeted. The author reasons that top schools ranked according to multiple quality measures would offer more comprehensive curricula to their students. To be included in the sample, programs at minimum met two basic criteria: 1) a criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree program and 2) housed in a school recognized by a ranking system. Random sampling could not be used in this case as such a technique would select schools without criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree programs. Thus, purposive sampling was used. Locating a sample of undergraduate criminology and criminal justice programs was difficult as a comprehensive list of such programs from which to sample is not available<sup>2</sup>. In order to create a sample of programs, four ranking systems of universities and colleges were considered: the Princeton Review's annual "Best 373 Colleges<sup>3</sup>," Princeton Review's "Best Value Colleges<sup>4</sup>," U.S. News and World Report's list of the top criminology graduate schools<sup>5</sup>, and U.S. News and World Report's "Best Colleges." The U.S. News and World Report's "Best Colleges" ranking system (U.S. News, 2011) was selected because it offered the most comprehensive ranking lists from which to create a sample of programs. At the time of this study, the 2011 edition of "Best Colleges" was the most recent available.

*The U.S. News' goal* is to provide "as much information as possible about the comparative merits of the educational programs at America's colleges and universities" (U.S. News, 2011). The rankings are based on up to 16 key measures of quality "which fall into seven categories: peer assessment; graduation and retention rates; faculty resources; student selectivity; financial resources; alumni giving; and, only for national universities and national liberal arts colleges, graduation rate performance and high school counselor undergraduate academic reputation ratings" (U.S. News, 2011). Colleges and universities were ranked by their total weighted score and are divided into Tier 1 and Tier 2. Tier 2 schools are ranked, but their ranks do not get published and are listed in alphabetical order. Further, the ranking system stratifies U.S. colleges and universities by institution type into four main categories: national universities, national liberal arts colleges, regional universities, and regional colleges. The schools in the two latter categories are stratified into one of four geographic regions: North, South, Midwest, and West. A historically black college and university category is also provided (U.S. News, 2011).

---

<sup>2</sup> CriminalJusticePrograms.com offers a comprehensive list of "criminal justice" programs but excludes "criminology" programs (CriminalJusticePrograms.com, 2011). Since human trafficking is both a criminal justice system and criminological issue, a sample excluding one type of program would be unsuitable.

<sup>3</sup> The Princeton Review's annual "Best 373 Colleges" lists the top schools according to the survey of 122,000 students (Princeton Review, 2011). Students were asked to rate their satisfaction with the colleges and universities that they were attending. While students' opinions are important, there is no guarantee that students were capable of assessing the quality of education and other vital statistics of their schools.

<sup>4</sup> Princeton Review's "Best Value Colleges" lists "academically outstanding" schools that offer the best financial aid programs and are relatively inexpensive (Princeton Review, 2011). This list was considered too short because not all listed schools offer undergraduate programs in criminology and criminal justice.

<sup>5</sup> U.S. News and World Report ranks top criminology graduate schools (U.S. News, 2011). However, this ranking system was not selected because it ranks only criminology graduate programs and provides a fairly small list. There are 28 programs listed, and only 20 of them are ranked. The author believes that a sample of 20 graduate programs in criminology is not sufficient to represent criminology and criminal justice undergraduate programs in the U.S.



A sample of one hundred U.S. colleges and universities with criminal justice and criminology undergraduate programs was created by using the *U.S. News and World Report* ranking system. To provide a diverse sampling of the different types of institutions, twenty schools were selected from five categories: national universities, national liberal arts colleges, regional universities, regional colleges, and historically black colleges and universities. Two historically black schools were also ranked in other categories; so in order to avoid duplication, they were first counted in the other categories and excluded from the HBCU category.

To be included in the sample, a school must offer a bachelor degree in Criminology and/or Criminal Justice or have “criminology,” “criminal justice,” or “crime” in the bachelor degree title. Minors, concentrations, and certificate programs in criminology and criminal justice were not considered to be full programs and thus were excluded. Twenty schools offering criminology and/or criminal justice bachelor degree programs were selected in descending rank order from the lists of national universities, national liberal arts colleges, and historically black colleges and universities. In each category, the author began with the highest ranked school and proceeded down the list examining each school for the presence of a qualified program. Each time such a program was detected, it was added to the sample. The author stopped once twenty programs were selected from a category. The same approach was used in the lists of regional universities and regional colleges, but since these are stratified into four geographic regions, five qualifying programs were selected in descending rank order from the schools listed in each regional sub-category (totaling twenty from the overall category).

The total sample consists of 100 colleges and universities *with* criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree programs drawn from *U.S. News and World Report* rankings in five categories (not to be confused with “the top 100 programs” or “programs at the top 100 schools”). The 100 schools consist of 66 private and 34 public institutions ranging in student enrollment from 324 to 55,014 students. Because this sample was drawn from lists of top-ranked schools in their categories, the study’s findings will not be generalizable to criminology and criminal justice programs at colleges and universities across the United States. The results of this study could be different if another sample and sampling method were used. However, the purpose of this study is not to make broad generalizations but to make an initial inquiry into the presence of human trafficking courses in undergraduate criminology and criminal justice curricula beginning with some of the nation’s top schools.

*U.S. News* defines *national universities* as universities that “offer a full range of undergraduate majors, as well as master’s and doctoral degrees and <... > committed to producing groundbreaking research” (U.S. News, 2011). There are 262 universities in this category. National universities included in the sample range in rankings from 5 to 94.

*National liberal arts colleges* “emphasize undergraduate education and award at least 50 percent of their degrees in the liberal arts” (U.S. News, 2011). Out of 266 national liberal arts colleges, only ten Tier 1 colleges have undergraduate programs in Criminology and/or Criminal Justice (ranked from 32 to 174); these colleges were added to the sample. In order to reach the quota of twenty schools for this category, ten Tier 2 colleges were selected.

*Regional universities* “provide a full range of undergraduate programs and some master’s level programs. They offer few, if any, doctoral programs.” These 572 universities are ranked within four geographic areas: North, South, Midwest and West (U.S. News,

2011). *Regional colleges* “focus primarily on undergraduate education, just as the liberal colleges do, but grant fewer than 50 percent of their degrees in liberal arts disciplines. At these schools, at least 10 percent of undergraduate degrees awarded are bachelor’s degrees” (U.S. News, 2011). This list ranks 319 regional colleges that are divided into four geographic areas. The *U.S. News* also ranks *historically black colleges and universities* that are listed as part of the U.S. Department of Education’s Historically Black Colleges and Universities registry. Out of 89 historically black colleges and universities, only 17 Tier 1 colleges have undergraduate programs in Criminology and/or Criminal Justice (ranked from 8 to 34); these colleges were added to the sample. In order to reach the quota of twenty schools for this category, three Tier 2 colleges were also included in the sample.

### **Investigation**

For each of the 100 undergraduate programs identified, I carefully examined department websites, undergraduate catalogs, and/or school bulletins to detect courses on human trafficking in program curriculum. For most programs the current catalog and/or school bulletin academic year 2010–2011 was used. If for some reason the 2010–2011 catalog or bulletin was unavailable, then the most recently available was used.

Four variables were extracted from the web-based sources. Tabulated were the numbers of: 1) elective courses on human trafficking 2) required courses on human trafficking 3) courses containing some human trafficking content 4) human trafficking-related courses. A course was considered to be *on* human trafficking if any of the following terms were mentioned in the title: trafficking in persons, modern-day slavery, labor trafficking, sex trafficking, forced labor, and child trafficking or exploitation. A course was considered to contain some human trafficking content if any of these terms were merely included in the course description. Course descriptions were also searched for related issues such as prostitution and pornography, reasoning that these issues often intersect with human trafficking. If any of the related issues were mentioned in the description, but not a human trafficking issue, the course was then considered to be related to human trafficking and potentially contain some information about the subject.

It must be acknowledged here that some courses on human trafficking being taught may not have been detected by this investigation. Schools could have been offering courses on human trafficking during the time of the author’s search but not yet updated the department websites, undergraduate catalogs, and/or school bulletins. It is also possible that the more courses could have been added since this study was conducted.

Information on the program and school characteristics was also collected. These are academic unit (name of department or division for example), title of major, type of Bachelor’s degree granted (BA or BS for example), if department offered Master’s and/or PhD degrees, if any graduate-level courses on human trafficking were offered (using the same definitions mentioned for undergraduate programs above), if a school was public or private, school size, and school location (city/state). Tables 1–3 are offered to provide a deeper description of the sample.

Criminal justice and criminology undergraduate programs were offered through three types of academic units: departments, divisions, and schools. The majority of programs (86%) are hosted by a wide range of departments, including four interdisciplinary programs that belong to multiple departments. The most common department was criminal justice (21%). Most departments are interdisciplinary and teach predominantly social and behavioral science disciplines such as sociology, criminology, social work,

political science, anthropology, forensic science, and public affairs. Additionally, some departments teach disciplines that are considered to be extended beyond social and behavioral studies such as history, justice studies, cultural studies and communication studies. There are also divisions and schools that embrace a general category of social and behavioral sciences, and schools that are solely dedicated to the disciplines of criminal justice and criminology (see Table 1).

**Table 1 Academic Unit\***

Academic Unit	%
Criminal Justice	21
Sociology	10
Sociology and Criminal Justice OR Criminal Justice and Sociology	8
Sociology and Criminology	7
Combined Criminal Justice, Sociology, Social Work	5
Social Sciences	4
Criminal Justice and Criminology OR Criminology and Criminal Justice	3
Social and Behavioral Sciences OR Behavioral and Social Sciences	3
Behavioral Sciences	2
Criminology	2
Political Science and Criminal Justice	2
Sociology and Anthropology	2
Criminal Justice and Forensic Science	1
Criminology, Law and Society	1
Culture and Communication	1
Government & Justice Studies	1
History and Sociology	1
History, Politics, and Justice	1
Human Services	1
Justice and Policy Studies	1
Public Affairs	1
Social and Cultural Studies	1
Social Sciences and Criminal Justice	1
Sociology & Crime, Law and Justice	1
Sociology and Criminology & Law	1
Interdepartmental (interdisciplinary)	4
Division of Social Sciences	4
Division of Arts and Sciences	1
Division of Behavioral Sciences	1
Division of Social and Behavioral Sciences	1
School of Criminal Justice	2
School of Behavioral and Social Sciences	1
School of Criminology and Criminal Justice	1
School of Justice Studies	1
School of Public Administration, Social Work and Criminal Justice	1
School of Social Sciences	1

*Note.* Academic unit is a department unless otherwise noted

The majority of programs (73%) identified themselves as offering “criminal justice” as the major, and 10% were identified as “criminology” and 6% were identified as both “criminology and criminal justice.” Eleven percent offered some other type of crime studies major, such as “Criminal Justice Studies” and “Sociology and Criminology” (see Table 2). The most common bachelor’s degree offered was a Bachelor of Arts (45%) followed closely by a Bachelor of Sciences (36%), and 11% of the programs offered both the Bachelor of Arts and the Bachelor of Sciences. Six schools in the sample provided another type of degree, such as “Bachelor of Criminal Justice” and “Bachelor of Applied Arts and Sciences in Criminal Justice.” Two schools did not specify what type of undergraduate degree they offer; therefore, the information about the type of degree for these programs was recorded as “unclear” (see Table 3).

**Table 2 Title of Major**

Title of Major	%
Criminal Justice	73
Criminology	10
Criminology and Criminal Justice OR Criminal Justice and Criminology	6
Criminal Justice Studies	2
Sociology and Criminology	2
Administration of Criminal Justice	1
Crime, Law and Justice	1
Criminology and Criminal Justice Studies	1
Criminology and Law	1
Criminology and Law Studies	1
Criminology, Law and Society	1
Sociology and Criminal Justice Administration	1

Although the focus was undergraduate programs, graduate programs offered by the schools in the sample were also reviewed in case they provide interesting comparisons to the undergraduate programs. Thirty schools offer Master’s degrees, and ten schools have doctoral programs that offer PhD degrees. Due to the *U.S. News* classification methods, all doctoral programs are offered by national universities (U.S. News, 2011).

**Table 3 Type of Bachelor’s Degree**

Type of Bachelor’s Degree	%
B.A.	45
B.S.	36
B.A and B.S.	11
B.A., B.S. and BAAS	1
B.A., BCJ	1
Bachelor of Criminal Justice	1
Major in Applied Criminal Justice	1
Major in Criminology	1
Not clear	2

## Findings

### *Undergraduate Courses*

After a careful search, the author was unable to find a single required or elective course with a *human trafficking subject title* listed in the web-based documentation (described earlier) for of the 100 programs comprising the sample. Eight courses from seven programs were found to have strong potential to include content on human trafficking. Three courses mentioned the subject of human trafficking in the descriptions but did not indicate it as a focus, and the other five contained information related to human trafficking. An analysis of these courses follows, beginning with the three courses containing some human trafficking content.

*CRIM 150 Evidence-Based Crime and Justice Policy* is a required course offered through a criminology program at a national university. According to its description, this course is designed to familiarize students with “statistical techniques and quantitative reasoning” as “essential tools for properly examining crime and justice policy.” To address appropriate statistical procedures and “sound quantitative reasoning,” the course would apply a case study. The description further lists potential subjects to be used as a case study: “death penalty, racial profiling, *human trafficking*, DNA identification, sentencing guidelines, drug testing, war crimes, ballistic analyses from the JFK assassination, and others” (italics added). Students taking this course may have an opportunity to learn about human trafficking, if the subject is selected to be used as a case study. Clearly, the course is focused on statistical techniques and quantitative methodology and is not specifically designed to discuss human trafficking.

While many programs list courses on organized crime as part of their curricula, there is only one course listed that mentions the subject of human trafficking in its description. Offered by a criminology program in one of the regional colleges in the South, *CRIM 356 Organized Crime* ties human trafficking with organized crime groups “including the Mafia, Yakusa, Triads and drug cartels.” The course covers the “historical evolution” of such groups and focuses on different types of illegal activities, such as “illegal drugs, extortion, gambling, loan sharking, *human trafficking*, *prostitution*, international trafficking in stolen cars, money laundering, and others” (italics added). The course is an elective, but it may be helpful in teaching students the basics of human trafficking. However, its description is rather brief, making it difficult to assess the quality of its content.

*CJUS-P 474 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia* is an elective course offered through a criminal justice program at a national university. The course reviews the Russian criminal justice system by examining “how the executive, legislative, and judicial branches of government are being influenced by the forces of transition.” “Analysis of Russian crime, including corruption, patterns of interpersonal violence, *human trafficking*, and drug use” (italics added) is included in the course. Being a comparative justice course, it is not specifically designed to cover the subject of human trafficking. More information would be needed to assess the course’s ability to teach students the basics of the subject. Since the course focuses on criminal justice in Russia, it may not extend deeply into human trafficking as a global issue.

Subjects that often intersect with human trafficking, include prostitution, pornography, and organized crime. Adult and child victims are often forced or coerced into prostitution and the pornography industry, and much trafficking is committed by criminal organizations. Because they include references to these related subjects, the five following courses may address human trafficking in some fashion and to some extent.

*CJUS-P 423 Sexuality and the Law* is an elective course taught in a criminal justice program at a national university. According to the course description, the course examines “legal and cultural debates regarding sexual images and acts, the criminalization of motherhood, the international *prostitution industry*, and *mass rape*” (italics added). *CRJU 4025 Drugs, Addictions, Vice and Crime* is an elective course offered by a criminal justice program at a historically black university. The course examines “the causes, prevention and control of the so-called ‘victimless crimes’ such as drug use, addictions, gambling and *prostitution*” and “other criminal offenses associated with crimes of vice” (italics added). *CJ 412 Deviant Behavior* is an elective course offered through a criminal justice program at a historically black university. This course examines the types of deviant behavior including “sexual deviations, addictive behavior, *organized crime*, gambling, and *prostitution*” (italics added). *0501-522 Victimless Crime* is an elective course offered at a regional university. The course touches upon “the illegal activity associated with *prostitution*, gambling, homosexuality, drug use and *pornography*” as it purports to evaluate the “social, moral, legal and practical consequences of legalizing such activities” (italics added). *CJ 274 - Sex, Violence & Crime on the Internet* is an elective course that discusses the impact that modern-day technology has on crime, focusing specifically on “how the Internet has affected the structure of hate groups and the *child pornography* and *sexual predator* subcultures” (italics added).

### **Graduate Courses**

Some of the schools in the sample may offer graduate courses in human trafficking, even if they do not offer undergraduate courses covering the subject. However, of the forty included in the sample, only one graduate program was found that offers a course on a human trafficking subject. The course is offered through a Master’s program in criminal justice at a historically black university. *CJUS 537 Crime, Sex, Law and Order* is an elective that

...explores the global ties that exist between the international trafficking of sex workers and local criminal interest groups. With the rise of the global economy and internet connections, pornography has become a lucrative business enterprise for many members of organized crimes. The course examines the globalization of sex crimes and the issues of illegal trafficking of women and children.

As seen in the description, the course focuses sex trafficking. It does not appear to cover labor trafficking and trafficking of males, making it a specialized human trafficking course.

Four graduate courses were found that mentioned human trafficking subjects in their descriptions. To begin, *P674 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia* is an elective graduate course cross-listed with the undergraduate course *CJUS-P 474 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia* mentioned above. The courses’ descriptions are almost identical, and just as its undergraduate counterpart, the graduate course provides an overview of the Russian criminal justice system and is not specifically designed to cover the subject of human trafficking.

*CRIM 7336 Globalization of Crime and Justice*, offered at a national university, “examines how globalization and internationalization affect crime and crime control in the United States (e.g., *human trafficking*)” (italics added). The course discusses global criminology by “including the analysis of international and regional trends and differences

in law, crime, and justice.” Because it is a global course that includes human trafficking as an example issue, it likely covers some important information on the subject. However, more information would be needed to decide if the course effectively covers the basics of human trafficking.

The elective course *CJ 823 Globalization of Crime* has a fairly brief description: “International crimes and organized crime. *Trafficking in women, children, and body parts*. Related problems such as firearm violence, money laundering, and corruption that transcend national boundaries” (italics added). Trafficking in body parts is recognized as a form of human trafficking under the Palermo Protocol (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2000). The provided framework is narrowed because the course does not cover trafficking of men, although the course could be broad in its coverage of trafficking of women, children, and body parts.

*CJUS 514 Transnational Organized Crime* is an elective that covers illegal activities of organized criminal groups, such as “transnational money laundering, drug trafficking, *trafficking of women and children for sex*, and *illegal human trafficking*” (italics added). While the course is not exclusively on human trafficking, it could conceivably go into depth on human trafficking issues and the male and labor trafficking could be covered under “illegal human trafficking.”

Finally, two graduate courses were found that appear to be related to the subject of human trafficking. *SOC 6273 The Sex Industry* provides an overview of the sex industry in the United States and other countries. The course examines “*prostitution, pornography*, and other forms of *sex work*” (italics added). It is not clear from the course description however that these issues are covered through a victimological perspective. *CJ 566 Juvenile Sex Offenders and Victims* also discuss the issues of pornography, prostitution and the victims of sex offenses. As mentioned earlier, sex work issues are closely related to the subject of human trafficking.

## Discussion

The results of the current investigation suggest that human trafficking is not widely covered in undergraduate criminal justice and criminology curricula among the 100 programs examined. No courses exclusively on human trafficking were found, and only eight courses from seven programs could be found that mentioned or are related to the subject. Graduate courses on human trafficking appeared to be more likely. Of forty graduate programs, six courses were found that cover or are related to the subject; one program offered a course dedicated to human trafficking. Further, the majority of undergraduate and graduate courses focused on sex trafficking or sexual victimization. None mentioned “labor trafficking” or “forced labor” in their titles or descriptions. Also, some focused on women and children as potential victims. The only course dedicated to human trafficking was limited to sex trafficking of women and children. Thus, labor trafficking specifically seemed to be ignored.

Human trafficking may be considered among other issues that have been ignored in the past by criminal justice and criminology academic curricula such as gay and lesbian issues (Cannon & Dirks-Linhorst, 2006), environmental crime (Situ & Emmons, 1996), high technology crime investigation (Myers & Myers, 2002), and security-related topics (Kooi & Hinduja, 2008). It is not assumed or asserted here that a good undergraduate criminology or criminal justice program must have a cataloged human trafficking course or that an injustice exists if human trafficking courses are not taught in a large portion of

the programs. However, if the presence of human trafficking in regular course offerings was to be commensurate with the seriousness of the problem and large body of scholarly work on the subject, especially considering the current importance placed on international studies and victimology, then it seems that a noticeable group of courses dedicated to human trafficking should exist in a far-reaching, even if non-representative, sample of programs from throughout the country.

Undergraduate criminal justice and criminology curriculum would benefit from the formal inclusion of courses dedicated to human trafficking. Human trafficking is a major (under-reported) transnational *crime* that requires *criminal justice* intervention and, thus, should have a meaningful place among criminal justice and criminology courses. Just as training on human trafficking would be beneficial for law enforcement personnel, an education on human trafficking as a crime, violation of human rights, and global social problem would be beneficial to college students who may go on to work in a variety of fields responding to the problem.

### ***Recommendations for Human Trafficking Courses***

An ideal human trafficking course would provide students with a solid understanding of the scope of contemporary slavery and trafficking of humans, their causes, and their consequences to the international community. The causes and consequences of human trafficking should be examined in light of theory and research from criminology. Human trafficking can be better covered by adding new courses as well as content to current courses. Courses may also be taught jointly with other departments. This collaboration would educate students from multiple disciplines about human trafficking utilizing a reasonable diffusion of resources. A course should provide a general context of human trafficking by covering a variety of issues related to the crime. Dragiewicz (2008, p. 193) recommends addressing a number of foundational issues such as poverty, migration, prostitution, and data reliability issues “before diving into a discussion of trafficking.” Views on these issues will widely differ however. Therefore, Situ and Emmons (1996) advocate the seminar rather than lecture format to effectively address controversy in the classroom: “In the seminar format, the fuller and freer exchange of conflicting viewpoints can be facilitated by group discussions and team debates” (Situ & Emmons, 1996, p. 152).

At the beginning of a course, it would be important to create a framework for developing students’ understanding of human trafficking as not only a violation of law but also a violation of human rights. This could begin by recognizing poverty and global inequality as the context for exploitation and the main driving force behind human trafficking. For example, wealthier countries’ economic policies often dictate terms to the poorer ones. Within this context, global migration patterns should be explored by examining socioeconomic and political conditions that motivate individuals to migrate. “Globalization and transitioning state economic structures” are key factors that facilitate “wars, armed conflicts, and social and economic crises” and, thus, make individuals and communities vulnerable to human trafficking (Hernandez, 2010, p.8). Without job prospects and thus the means to feed themselves and their families, workers seek opportunities in other countries. This includes engaging in illegal activity (human smuggling for example) which makes people who are already vulnerable even more susceptible to being trafficked and exploited because they cannot seek help from authorities (Dragiewicz, 2008).



A well-designed course will review human trafficking in all of its manifestations. This entails discussing both labor and sex trafficking of adults and children, females and males, and local and foreign citizens. A fair assessment of the crime would avoid a skewed focus on one type of trafficking over another; such a focus would do a disservice to students. Naturally, a course on a particular type of trafficking, such as sex trafficking, would be valuable in that it can go into depth on a trafficking issue. The problem occurs when a course is presented as a general human trafficking course but neglects major areas. Even in more focused courses, however, all types of victims should receive equitable attention. Focusing on victims belonging to some social categories over others may create the impression that some victims are more worthy than others.

Students should become familiar with the most recent research on trafficking, including that covered in reports prepared by the United Nations, International Labor Organization, the U.S. Department of State, and the U.S. Department of Justice. However, estimates of the scope and magnitude of human trafficking provided by these and various nongovernmental organizations will differ considerably and should be approached critically. Dragiewicz (2008, p. 196) views these discrepancies as an opportunity to teach students about the strengths and weaknesses of qualitative and quantitative research methods for learning about crime:

All of these numbers are akin to speculation, and it is a good idea to talk about why these numbers are presented in the absence of solid data, why the estimates may look so different from one another, and how and what we can learn about the magnitude of trafficking despite these gaps in data. Like other sensitive, illegal, and covert issues, research on trafficking is better suited to some forms of investigation than others. Studies conducted with trafficking victims, traffickers, or others are often more amenable to qualitative methods that can reveal something about the nature of trafficking, the tactics traffickers use, and the conditions that contribute to its occurrence.

Students should also be introduced to international, federal, and, whenever possible, state anti-trafficking legislation. When covering legal definitions of human trafficking, it would be constructive to also discuss offenses that are often not acknowledged as human trafficking. Although the United Nations Palermo Protocol's definition provides the most coverage and recognizes a multitude of forms of exploitation, it still does not cover several existing outlets of human trafficking. The U.S. Trafficking Victims Protection Act too excludes many offenses. At the same time, human trafficking should be distinguished from other crimes. Human smuggling, for instance, is often confused with human trafficking.

Barone (2003) provides a list of crimes and human rights abuses that should be acknowledged as human trafficking: commercial sexual exploitation, such as prostitution, pornography, and sex tourism; trafficking for the purpose of non-commercial sex, such as marriages for the purpose of child-bearing, forced marriages, early marriages, temporary marriages, and mail-order brides (i.e., bride trafficking); trafficking for the purpose of forced labor, in particular domestic service, street begging, and camel jockeying; trafficking for the purpose of illicit inter-country adoption (i.e., baby trafficking); trafficking for military purposes; trafficking for the purpose of involvement in illegal activities, such as drug trafficking; and trafficking in human organs. Some of these offenses are often not recognized as human trafficking. A course should address the potential consequences for those affected by these offenses, acknowledge that authorities may not

consider them as human trafficking victims (if victims at all), and discuss the harm to victims that is not being redressed.

Regarding practical issues, students should become familiar with potential indicators of human trafficking and the immediate and long-term effects of victimization. In fact professionals such as law enforcement officers, attorneys, and social service providers could be recruited as guest speakers who could offer valuable information based on their experiences. As Situ and Emmons (1996, p. 153) state, “these speakers not only contribute their rich experience to the class but also serve as models to students who plan to work in law enforcement.”

Finally, prostitution should be critically addressed in a human trafficking course. Prostitution is considered by many to be a “victimless crime,” including some crime and justice scholars (Frase, 2002). However, for prostitution to truly be a victimless crime, all parties must be completely willing to engage in sexual exchange without coercion and able to give consent to such activities—meaning that both parties must be over 18 years of age and mentally and emotionally capable. Many times, the observer will fail to recognize that a person offering sexual services is not a completely willing participant. Prostitution has become a subject that ignites ideological debates among organizations and individuals involved in the anti-trafficking movement (Dragiewicz, 2008). Some scholars assert that radical feminists and some faith-based nongovernmental organizations conflate prostitution and sex trafficking by perceiving all prostitution as forms of trafficking (Dragiewicz, 2008; Weitzer, 2007). Other feminists may argue that women have the right to use their bodies and sexuality for economic gain. This ideological conflict is complex and deserves careful study; nonetheless, it should be emphasized that some of “prostitutes” could in fact be sex trafficking victims. It is essential that prostitution and sex trafficking not be conflated however. While it can be acknowledged that adults sometimes consent to illegal forms of work and migration, distinctions between consensual sex work and trafficking need to be made (Dragiewicz, 2008).

## Conclusion

The results of the current study must be interpreted in the context of its limitations. First, as noted earlier, the use of a nonrandom sample means that the findings cannot be generalized to all undergraduate criminology or criminal justice programs in the United States. The sample was, however, drawn from a population of colleges and universities across the nation recognized for providing a well-rounded education. The fact that human trafficking courses could not be found in their documented curricula is itself meaningful. Furthermore, some courses on human trafficking being taught may not have been detected by this research. Many programs offered courses dedicated to “current issues” or “special topics” that discuss different topics based on instructor or student interest. This is particularly true when a new topic of research emerges such as human trafficking. Many of the programs examined offered these kinds of courses. Some listed potential topics in the description and thus were reviewed. Many, however, did not specify which topics would be covered, and it could not be known if they covered human trafficking.

These limitations may be addressed by future research. Results from other studies could then be compared to those of the current study. First, course syllabi and assigned readings, activities, and lecture content could be requested from instructors and analyzed to detect coverage of human trafficking not identified in catalog titles and descriptions. Second, other listings of colleges and universities could be used as sampling frames to explore the

possibility that human trafficking courses have a stronger existence at other types of schools. Examples include top criminal justice and criminology graduate programs ranked by *U.S. News and World Report* or in journal articles, the undergraduate criminal justice programs listed by *CriminalJusticePrograms.com*, and community and junior colleges. Third, human trafficking courses in other programs such as sociology, political science, and social work should also be researched. Fourth, criminal justice education programs outside of academia could also be researched. For example, it should be expected that professional training programs such as those of police academies are including human trafficking education, as police officers may frequently come into contact with victims and offenders of human trafficking (exploited youth and pimps for example). Conferences, seminars, and other brief programs offering training and continuing education to a variety of criminal justice and human services professional could also be studied.

Human trafficking is a global social problem. The subject requires attention from criminology and criminal justice educators as they are in a special position to shape their students' perceptions of crime and ways to deal with it. By including courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice curricula, undergraduate bachelor degree programs would prepare well-informed graduates who understand the social complexity of human trafficking. By including courses dedicated primarily to human trafficking in curricula, criminology and criminal justice programs would play a larger part in improving responses to the problem by criminal justice professionals and increasing public awareness of the crime.

## References

- Aronowitz, A. A. (2009). *Human trafficking, human misery: The global trade in human beings*. Westport, CT, London: Praeger.
- Bales, K. (2007). *Ending slavery: how we free today's slaves*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Bales, K., & Lize, S. (2005). *Trafficking in persons in the United States: A report to the National Institute of Justice*. Oxford, MS: Croft Institute for International Studies, University of Mississippi. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/211980.pdf>
- Bales, K., & Lize, S. (2007). Investigating human trafficking: Challenges, lessons learned, and best practices. *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*, 76(4), 24-32.
- Barone, T. (2003). The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000: defining the problem and creating a solution. *Temple International and Comparative Law Journal*, 17, 579-594.
- Bernat, F. P., & Zhilina, T. (2010). Human sex trafficking, the local becomes global. *Women & Criminal Justice*, 20(1/2), 2-9.
- Cannon, K. D., & Dirks-Linhorst, A. P. (2006). How will they understand if we don't teach them? The status of criminal justice education on gay and lesbian issues. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 17(2), 262-278.
- Chacon, J. M. (2010). Tensions and trade-offs: Protecting trafficking victims in the era of immigration enforcement. *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, 158(6), 1609-1653.
- CriminalJusticePrograms.com. (2011). Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.criminaljusticeprograms.com/>
- Department of Homeland Security. (2007). Combating modern-day slavery: reauthorization of anti-trafficking programs. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/071031forman.pdf>

- Dragiewicz, M. (2008). Teaching about trafficking: Opportunities and challenges for critical engagement. *Feminist teacher*, 18(3), 185-201.
- Farrell, A., McDevitt, J., & Fahy, S. (2008). *Understanding and improving law enforcement responses to human trafficking*. Washington D.C.: National Institute of Justice.
- Farrell, A. (2009). State and local law enforcement responses to human trafficking: explaining why so few trafficking cases are identified in the United States. *Sociology of Crime, Law, and Deviance*, 13, 243-259.
- Frase, R. S. (2002). Victimless crime. In *Encyclopedia of Crime and Justice* (Vol. 4, pp. 1626-1629). New York, NY: Macmillan.
- Gozdziak, E. M., & Bump, M. N. (2008). Data and research on human trafficking: Bibliography of research-based literature. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/224392.pdf>
- Hernandez, M. B. (2010). Confronting human trafficking: Nongovernmental organizations and the U. S. anti-human trafficking approach. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). The Ohio State University, Columbus.
- International Labor Organization. (2008). *ILO action against trafficking in human beings*. Geneva: International Labor Office.
- Kooi, B., & Hinduja, S. (2008). Teaching security courses experientially. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 19(2), 290-307.
- Logan, T. K., Walker, R., & Hunt, G. (2009). Understanding human trafficking in the United States. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 10(1), 3-30.
- Myers, L. J., & Myers, L. B. (2002). Preparing for high technology crime: An educational assessment of criminal justice and criminology academic programs. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 13(2), 251-271.
- Natarajan, M. (2002). International criminal justice education: A note on curricular resources. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 13(2), 479-498.
- Picarelli, J. T. (2009). Enabling norms and human trafficking. In H. Friman (Ed.), *Crime and the global political economy* (pp. 85-101). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.
- Princeton Review. (2011). *The best 373 colleges, 2011 edition*. Princeton Review.
- Shirk, D., & Webber, A. (2004). Slavery without borders: Human trafficking in the U.S.-Mexican context. *Hemisphere Focus*, 7(5), 1-5.
- Shirk, D. A., & Webber, A. T. (2009). Human trafficking and protections for undocumented victims in the United States. In K. Staudt, T. Payan, & A. Kruszewski (Eds.), *Human rights along the U.S.-Mexico border: Gendered violence and insecurity* (pp. 168-182). Tucson, AZ: The University of Arizona Press.
- Situ, Y., & Emmons, D. (1996). Teaching environmental crime in a criminal justice curriculum. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 7(1), 147-154.
- Tiefenbrun, S. (2002). The saga of Susannah. A U.S. remedy for sex trafficking in women: The Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000. *Utah Law Review Society*, 107-175.
- Turner, K. B., Giacomassi, D., & Vandiver, M. (2006). Ignoring the past: Coverage of slavery and slave patrols in criminal justice texts. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 17(1), 181-195.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2000). United Nations Convention against transnational organized crime and the protocols thereto. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from

- <http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf>
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2010). Status of ratification. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from [http://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg\\_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en](http://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en)
- U.S. Attorney General. (2010). *Attorney General's annual report to Congress and assessment of U.S. Government activities to combat trafficking in persons: Fiscal Year 2009*. Washington D.C.: Department of Justice.
- U. S. Department of Health and Human Services. (2011). About human trafficking. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/index.html#overview>.
- U. S. Department of State. (2003). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2003/>.
- U. S. Department of State. (2004). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2004/>.
- U. S. Department of State. (2006). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2006/>.
- U. S. Department of State. (2008). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2008/>.
- U. S. Department of State. (2010). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2010/>.
- U. S. Congress. (2000). Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/10492.pdf>.
- U. S. News and World Report. (2011). Best colleges 2011: College rankings & lists. Retrieved on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2011 from <http://colleges.usnews.rankingsandreviews.com/best-colleges>.
- Weitzer, R. (2007). The social construction of sex trafficking: Ideology and institutionalization of a moral crusade. *Politics & Society*, 35(3), 447-475.
- Zhang, S. X. (2007). *Smuggling and trafficking in human beings: All roads lead to America*. Westport, CT: Praeger.